

August 29, 2012

Brian Ernewein, General Director, Legislation Tax Policy Branch 140 O'Connor St. Ottawa, ON K1A 0G5

Re: "Prohibited Investment" Rules under Part XI.01 of the *Income Tax Act* - RRSPs and RRIFs

Following our letters of December 13, 2011 and March 8, 2012 and past discussions with the Department of Finance staff where we discussed our concerns with the "prohibited investment" rules (the "Rules") under Part X1.01 of the *Income Tax Act*, we were very pleased to review your letter of June 12, 2012 (the "Letter") which addressed a number of concerns raised by PMAC and other industry associations.

We are delighted that the Department of Finance has agreed with some of the concerns we raised and will be recommending to the Minister of Finance that technical amendments be introduced to modify the impact of some of the Rules.

As you are aware, one of PMAC's key advocacy priorities has been to seek clarity with the Federal government on the impact of the Rules as they apply to investments made by RRSPs and RRIFs. The Rules currently require for example, certain portfolio managers or investment fund managers (who are caught by the rules due to owning in excess of 10% of their firms that manage pooled funds) to liquidate their (and family) registered accounts from these funds as a result of the possible interpretation of such relationship being non-arm's length. As noted in your Letter, the arm's length test is not as brightline a test as the "related" party test and that, while many taxpayers who currently hold prohibited investments appear to be part of a group with very close ties to the investment entity, it is possible to hold a portfolio position that, unknown to the taxpayer, is in fact a prohibited investment for the taxpayer's RRSP due to the combination of family holdings and/or non-arm's length relationships.

We are pleased that the Department of Finance has agreed with us and others that the scope of the definition of "prohibited investment" is too broad in certain cases and could apply in circumstances where a particular individual's registered plan holds a comparatively small investment in, for example, an investment fund controlled by their employer or by the employer of a family member.

We support the Department of Finance's recommendations for significant changes to the Rules to address these and other concerns. In particular, we applaud the recommendation to narrow the definition of "prohibited investment" such that the rule stating that investments in entities with which you (or any entity in which you have a significant interest) do not deal at arm's length is repealed. This would ensure that the prohibited investment rules do not apply in circumstances where the planholder both lacks a significant interest in the Issuer in question and deals at arm's length with the Issuer.

It is worth noting however, that there is still some uncertainty as to whether a planholder who holds a *controlling interest* in a fund manager, could be considered not to deal at arm's length with funds managed by that fund manager, and thus an investment in such a fund could be a prohibited investment. We would appreciate further clarity in this regard. In addition, we still believe there is room for further clarity regarding the application of the arm's length test generally in order to provide more certainty regarding the application of the Rules. Similarly, there is still difficulty in trying to determine whether the 10% threshold is triggered. For example, an individual and fund manager, may not know what investments relatives such as siblings, parents, children and in-laws have made. Moreover, privacy laws may prevent financial intermediaries from disclosing information necessary to determine ownership thresholds. Consequently, portfolio managers may not be able to determine whether the 10% rule may be triggered by a client, thereby having potentially disastrous results for the client.

We will continue to monitor the impact of the Rules on our membership and are also awaiting a response from the CRA to a request for interpretation we submitted in March 2012.

We would like to express our gratitude to the Department of Finance for acknowledging that the Rules are inappropriately broad and should not catch many of the investments discussed in our prior submissions that are not the target of the Rules.

We look forward to your continued efforts in recommending the proposed changes outlined in your Letter and would be pleased to respond to any further questions you may have.

lott Mahafly

Yours truly;

PORTFOLIO MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION OF CANADA

Katie Walmsley President, PMAC Scott Mahaffy Chair, Industry, Regulation & Tax Committee Vice President, Legal, MFS McLean Budden Ltd.

## PORTFOLIO MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION OF CANADA MEMBERSHIP LIST 2012

Adroit Investment Management Ltd. Acuity Investment Management Inc. Aegon Capital Management Inc.

AGF Investments Inc. Aldersley Securities Inc. Alitis Investment Counsel Inc.

AMG Canada

ATB Investment Management Inc.
Aurion Capital Management Inc.
Avenue Investment Management Inc.
Barometer Capital Management Inc.
Barrantagh Investment Management Inc.

Baskin Financial Services Inc.

Beaujolais Private Investment Management Bellwether Investment Management Inc.

Beutel, Goodman & Company Ltd.

BlackRock Asset Management Canada Limited

Bloom Investment Counsel, Inc. BMO Asset Management Inc.

BMO Harris Investment Management Inc. BNP Paribas Investment Partners Canada Ltd.

Brandes Investment Partners & Co. Bull Capital Management Inc. Burgundy Asset Management Ltd.

Bush Associates Ltd.

C.A. Delaney Capital Management Ltd.

C.F.G. Heward Investment Management Ltd. Campbell & Lee Investment Management Inc.

Canoe Financial L.P.

Canso Investment Counsel Ltd. Cardinal Capital Management Inc. Celernus Investment Partners Inc.

**CGOV Asset Management** 

CIBC Global Asset Management Inc. CIBC Private Investment Counsel

Cockfield Porretti Cunningham Investment Counsel 1

Coleford Investment Management Ltd.

Connor, Clark & Lunn Investment Mgmt Ltd.

Cordiant Capital Inc.

Cougar Global Investments LP Covenant Capital Management Inc. Crestridge Asset Management Inc.

Crystal Wealth Management System Ltd.

Cypress Capital Management Ltd.

Integra Capital Ltd.

J.C. Hood Investment Counsel Inc.
Jones Collombin Investment Counsel Inc.

Kerr Financial Advisors Inc.

LDIC Inc.

Legg Mason Canada Inc.

Leith Wheeler Investment Counsel Ltd.

Leon Frazer & Associates Inc. Lester Asset Management Letko Brosseau & Associates Inc.

Letko Brosseau & Associates Inc. Longview Asset Management Ltd.

Lorne Steinberg Wealth Management Inc.

Louisbourg Investments Inc.

Macdonald, Shymko & Company Ltd.

Mackenzie Global Advisors

Macnicol & Associates Asset Management Inc.

Manitou Investment Management Ltd.

Manulife Asset Management Marquest Asset Management Inc. Martin, Lucas & Seagram Ltd.

Mawer Investment Management Ltd. McElvaine Investment Management Ltd.

MFS McLean Budden
MD Physician Services Inc.

Milestone Investment Counsel Inc.

Mirador Corporation

Montrusco Bolton Investments Inc. Morgan Meighen & Associates Ltd. Morguard Financial Corporation Newport Investment Counsel Inc. Nexus Investment Management Inc.

Northwood Family Office LP NT Global Advisors, Inc.

Pacific Spirit Investment Management Inc.

Patient Capital Management Inc.

Patrimonica Inc.

Perennial Asset Management Corp.
Perisen Capital Management Ltd.
Picton Mahoney Asset Management
Pier 21 Asset Management Inc.
Portfolio Management Corporation
Portland Investment Counsel Inc.
Rae & Lipskie Investment Counsel Inc.

RBC Phillips, Hager & North Investment Counsel Inc.

Davis-Rea Ltd.

De Luca Veale Investment Counsel Inc. Dixon Mitchell Investment Counsel Inc. Doherty & Associates Investment Counsel

Duncan Ross Associates Ltd.

Echlin Investment Management Ltd.

18 Asset Management Inc. ETF Capital Management Evans Investment Counsel Excel Investment Counsel Inc.

Exponent Investment management Inc.

Falcon Asset Management Inc.

Fiera Sceptre Inc.

Focus Asset Management
Foster Asset Management Inc.
Foyston, Gordon & Payne Inc.
Galileo Global Equity Advisors Inc.
Genova Private Management Inc.
Genus Capital Management Inc.
GFI Investment Counsel Ltd.

GLC Asset Management Group Ltd.

Global Wealth Builders Ltd.

Globeinvest Capital Management Inc.

Gluskin Sheff & Associates

Greystone Managed Investments Inc.

Groundlayer Capital Inc.

Gryphon Investment Counsel Inc.

Guardian Capital LP

Heathbridge Capital Management

Hélène Dion Investment Management Inc.

Hesperian Capital Management Ltd.
Highstreet Asset Management Inc.
Highview Asset Management Inc.
Hillsdale Investment Management Inc.
Horizons Investment Management Inc.
Howard, Barclay & Associates Ltd.
HSBC Investments (Canada) Ltd.

Hutton Investment Counsel Inc. IA Clarington Investments Inc.

Independent Accountant's Investment Counsel Inc.

Rempart Asset Management Inc.

Ridgewood Capital Asset Management Inc.

Rogan Investment Management Ltd.

Rondeau Capital Inc.

Russell Investments Canada Ltd. Scotia Asset Management L.P. Sharp Asset Management Inc.

Silver Heights Capital Management Inc.

Sionna Investment Managers

Sprung & Co. Investment Counsel Inc.

Stanton Asset Management Inc. State Street Global Advisors, Ltd.

Steadyhand Investment Management Ltd.

Stonegate Private Counsel

Strathbridge Asset Management Inc.

Stylus Asset Management Inc.

Successful Investor Wealth Management Inc.

Summerhill Capital Management Inc.

T.E. Investment Counsel Inc. Taylor Asset Management TD Asset Management Inc.

TD Harbour Capital (Div. Of TD Asset Management)

TD Waterhouse Private Investment Counsel Inc.

Tetrem Capital Management Ltd.
TFP Investment Counsel Corp.
Thornmark Asset Management Inc.
Toron Investment Management
TriDelta Investment Counsel
Tulett, Matthews & Associates

UBS Global Asset Management (Canada) Co. University of Toronto Asset Management

Van Arbor Asset Management Ltd. Vancity Investment Management Ltd. Venable Park Investment Counsel Inc. Vestcap Investment Management Inc.

Vision Wealth Management Ltd. W.A. Robinson & Associates Ltd.

Watson Di Primio Steel Investment Management Ltd.

West Face Capital Inc.

Wickham Investment Counsel Inc.